METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVIELE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission Sunnyside in Sevier Park 3000 Granny White Pike Nashville, Tennessee 37204 Telephone: (615) 862-7970 Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Expansion
June 18, 2014

Application: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Expansion

Map and Parcel Numbers: 83-10 113, 083-13 309-312, 314-330, 332-352, 354-357, 428-441, 443-460, 463-517, 534-536; 83-13D 001,002, and 900CO; 83-14 186-196, 203-

205, 229-244, 246-259, 261-264, 288-319, 353-362, 370; and 94-02 41-45

Council Districts: 06

Applicant: Council Member Peter Westerholm

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov, 615-862-7970

Description of Project: Councilmember Peter Westerholm is requesting the extension of the existing Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Recommendation Summary: Finding that the majority of the buildings meet the standards of the ordinance, Staff suggests the Commission recommend to City Council that the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded.

Staff recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines, with the additional italicized guidance for the 1400-1600 blocks of Boscobel, to also apply to the expanded area.

Attachments

A: Architectural Examples

Area to be expanded:



Applicable Ordinance:

Article III. Historic Overlay Districts

<u>17.36.120.A.</u> Historic Districts Defined. Historic Preservation and Neighborhood Conservation Districts. These districts are defined as geographical areas which possess a significant concentration, linkage or continuity of sites, buildings, structures or objects which are united by past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development, and that meet one or more of the following criteria:

- 1. The district is associated with an event that has made a significant contribution to local, state or national history; or
- 2. It includes structures associated with the lives of persons significant in local, state or national history; or
- 3. It contains structures or groups of structures that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic value, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- 4. It has yielded or may be likely to yield archaeological information important in history or prehistory; or
- 5. It is listed or is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Background:

The neighborhood hosted general informational meetings on December 11, 2013 and January 13, 2014. A "windshield" architectural resource survey was conducted by staff of the MHZC.

Analysis and Findings:

The area proposed to be included, with the exception of Boscobel Street, includes buildings constructed at the turn-of-the-century and helps to tell the story of the Lockeland Springs-East End neighborhood. The majority of the homes were constructed between the 1890s and the 1930s, as were many of the historic homes in the current boundaries. The extension of the overlay continues the architectural diversity of the rest of the neighborhood with primarily bungalow, and Queen Anne styles. The inclusion of these areas helps to match the neighborhood boundaries with the overlay boundaries. The properties now proposed to be added were not included at time of the initial designation of the neighborhood due to lack of support.

The 1400-1600 blocks of Boscobel Street have characteristics that are unique to the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation overlay district: it has very few historic structures (only 8 that have frontage on Boscobel) most of which lie near South 17th Street; it lies in a depression where the grade drops more than 20 feet across the length of some of the parcels; one of the block faces lacks an improved alley for vehicular access; there has been significant new construction on these blocks since 2010, most of which is in a contemporary style and two-stories in height with a flat roof form.

Despite the lack of historic context, these blocks are important to include in the overlay as new construction here affects the rest of the district, due to its geographic location within the interior of the neighborhood.

Because of the scarcity of historic structures and the other noted unique characteristics of these blocks, the design guidelines for new construction will include italicized information to allow infill on the 1400-1600 blocks to meet these additional criteria that may not be appropriate in areas where the historic context is more complete:

- The height of new buildings may be up to 2 stories.
- The width of new buildings may be up to 40 feet.
- The roofs of new buildings may be flat or have minimal slopes.
- Attached garages may be appropriate where there is not an improved alley or where there is a significant grade change of more than 15 feet across the parcel.
- Front loaded garages may be appropriate if there is no improved alley access to the parcel, but they should have a recessed entry.

The properties meet standard 3 of section 17.26.120.A. of the design guidelines as embodying the distinctive characteristics of their individual types and the overall period of the neighborhood and meet standard 5 as eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Not including Boscobel Street, approximately sixty-one percent (61%) of the principle buildings are considered contributing, meaning they contribute to the historic character of the district. Even including the largely non-contributing blocks of Boscobel, more than half of the buildings are contributing.

Finding that the majority of the buildings meet the standards of the ordinance, Staff suggests the Commission recommend to City Council that the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded.

Staff recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines, with the additional italicized guidance for the 1400-1600 blocks of Boscobel, to also apply to the expanded area.

EXAMPLES OF ARCHITECTURE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD



Historic duplex at 1608 Shelby Avenue



400 S 17th Street



1607 Shelby Avenue



312 South 17th Street



1626 Shelby Avenue



1600 Lillian Street



1500 Boscobel Street